



WORLD HERITAGE WATCH

The 5th International NGO Forum on World Heritage at Risk

Ramada City Center Hotel, Manama, 22 - 23 June 2018

We, the Civil Society Organizations who have attended the 5th International NGO Forum on World Heritage at Risk organized by World Heritage Watch on 22-23 June 2018 in Bahrain, coming from 24 countries in 6 continents, as active and concerned citizens dealing with Natural and Cultural World Heritage properties at different places, would like to bring the following to the attention of the World Heritage Committee:

Resolution

On the World Heritage Site “Fort and Shalimar Gardens” (WHC/18/42.COM/7B.Add.2)

The efforts and due diligence of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee and its Advisory bodies in the case of UHS Lahore Fort and Shalimar Gardens are deeply appreciated. Thanks go to the joint RMM of the World Heritage Center and ICOMOS for their commitment and dedication, in preparing a meticulous report providing factual observations and clear directions.

- I. **Orange Train Metro Project Shalimar Garden**
 1. The **UNESCO WHC ‘Draft Resolution’ is fully endorsed and supported, as it**
 - **‘unequivocally states irreversible damage’** to the OUV of the WHS, notably its ‘authenticity and integrity’ in accordance with Paragraph 179 of the Operational Guidelines
 - **Regrets** the State Party did not inform the WHC before any irreversible decision was taken/Para.172 Operational Guidelines
 - **Deeply regrets** that the project was completed without satisfactory HIA and State Party downplays the very serious environmental impacts of the orange metro and does not in any way reflect the reality on site
 - **Deeply regrets** that the state party did not invite the RMM in 2016 and 2017 as requested in Decision 40 COM 7B.43.
 - **Notes** that the property suffers from ‘severe visual impairment from inside and outside the garden and also notes heavy noise pollution and air pollution impacts.
 - **Decides, therefore, to inscribe** the Fort and Shalimar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan) on the **List of World Heritage in Danger;**”
- II. **Construction of ‘New Concrete Structure’ for Restaurant at Royal Kitchen Area, Lahore Fort**

- The State of Conservation Report by the State Party is silent on the addition of a new concrete kitchen and toilet structure for a fine dining restaurant at the Royal Kitchens of the Lahore Fort.
- All 'State Parties' are instructed to inform the Secretariat according to Paragraph 172 before carrying out any development work/addition/intervention which may affect the OUV of the property. This structure has already been built, without following due process.

III. Lessons Learnt

The above two cases are a transgression in adherence to the Operational Guidelines and local laws. It further proves that a formal mechanism to include Civil Society is necessary to ensure that the WHC and its Advisory Bodies have access to objective, neutral and transparent information', thereby strengthening the credibility of the Convention and safeguarding our collective heritage.

A '**precedent**' has been set by misrepresentation of facts combined with the holding back of information by the State Party causing irrevocable and irreversible loss of OUV of the World Heritage Site Lahore Fort and Shalimar Gardens. To learn from this precedent, it is registered that:

- Despite the previous World Heritage Committee decisions, the State Party provided misleading facts which delayed the RMM visit, which regrettably arrived after completion of construction works of the Orange Train.
- The State Party did not take into account opinions of civil society and local professional bodies. The advice, input and opinion of Civil Society/stakeholders should be a part of the process, through a 'formal inclusion' in the procedures and mechanisms of the Operational Guidelines to ensure neutral, objective & transparent' decision making and to safeguard and protect' all WH Sites.
- Strong inclusive monitoring mechanisms should be in place to ensure that the directions of the RMM are followed in letter and spirit. Civil society/stakeholders/advisory body representatives should be part of the implementation process of the recommendations of RMM 2018.
- The State Party should cooperate and implement all mitigation measures proposed by the RMM together with representatives of civil society/ICOMOS Pakistan to review mechanisms prior to implementation.

Recommendations

The elevated viaduct has caused irreversible visual impairment and damage to the world heritage site

- The detailed directions of the RMM are fully endorsed as mitigation measures with a cutoff date for the State Party to provide a detail proposal for technical approval prior to implementation by December 2018

- However, one of the recommendations will result in dislocation of a large population who reside in this very densely populated area. Alternative means have to be explored to move the vehicular traffic from GT Road
- Therefore, it is recommended that within the buffer zone a two way underground vehicular bypass is built under the current GT road and the area between the south wall and the commercial development is made into a green pedestrian zone to avoid traffic noise and pollution.
- The new kitchen structure at the Lahore Fort should be removed immediately.
- A formal inclusive mechanism should be created by the WHC to include the voice of civil society.

Manama, 23 June 2018